

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: CD
Application Name and Number: HD SM00006 - Impala Fishing (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant is 29% shareholder in nominated vessel. Info merged with vessel operator, Emile Adrien. Also right holder in Small Pelagic, Hake Longline, Tuna Longline		One of JV partners allocated right on appeal in 2002. In 2003 delay caused by application to use another vessel.	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
Not merged. Should be 1/3 Black and not 3/3.			
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
Properly merged			
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Apportioned between HDST, Pelagic and hake Longline.	COIDA registration not audited
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
3.6 million rand incurred investment. 5% increase in vessel share.	Turnover per ton: R10 395.59		

General Comments:	Enterprise Development		
Reliance: Applicant answered YES to 6.7.6 but does not provide amounts	JV venture: not enterprise development		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.2.2	Y	Y	Applicants turnover = R5 936 694 therefore had to comply with EE Act and did not do so voluntarily				
6.3.2	3/3 Black	1/3 Black	See above				
5.1	Y	N	See above				
11.2	Y	N	See above				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: MR
Application Name and Number: HDSM00007 - PREMIER FISHING SA (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
In a Joint Venture with BCP Owns 20% of the MFV Realeka whilst BCP owns 80% of the MFV Realeka. Applicant entitled to 48% of profit, BCP to 52%. Applicant has further apportioned its employees into the different sectors it's applying in.	Applicant replied "yes" to section 3.2 because 3 of its vessels were seized by MCM for contravening certain permit conditions. Vessels were released in terms of S62(2)of the MLRA. The charges were later withdrawn on condition that applicants skipper attend a workshop and an amount of R20000 per skipper is paid into the Marine Living Resources Fund.		Merged with Realeka / BCP 36% female 72% black
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
No females. 50% black	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
		34% female 60% black	30% female 50% black
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11% female 47% black in top levels Whole group presented.	12.60% female 51.60% black	16% of the applicant is owned by employees.	
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		No explanation how 25 employees claimed taking into consideration JV with BCP but it appears the 25 is 11 land based employees from Premier and 14 sea based employees from Realeka. The 14 employees is in terms of applicant's profit share in Realeka JV. BCP states that their portion of JV has been incorporated into their application. They subtract only 41%(not 48%) of JV jobs.	Applicant answered "yes" to section 7.1. The vessel MFV "Southern Victor" was detained for breaching provision of the act. On the same day the applicant paid a fine of R8151.00 and the vessel was released after applicant rectified its breach.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
No detail of how total insured value is calculated by taking into consideration the JV provided in Annexure 9A. Total Insured: R6 580 050.00 Total Insured per ton: R7 840.92	Turnover per ton : R11,759		
General Comments:			
Processing:		Enterprise Development	
Reliance: Applicant is in a JV with BCP – The JV MFV Realeka Joint Venture pays a management and marketing fee to BCP.	Realeka is a factory vessel.	Training to SMME's, legal advice to SMME's, purchased dinghies for use by WCRL limited.	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
3.2	Y	N	The charges were withdrawn (see above)				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: MR	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00010 - VIKING FISHING COMPANY (DEEP SEA) (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicants states that it is not relying on any information from its sister companies / Joint Venture companies / partners other than information from its holding company, transformation data is merged. Merger should be accepted as it will provide more accurate picture.			Merged : 50% black – 20% female Applicant : 50% Black, 22% female own
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
70% black No females	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
	27% black 17.30% female	Employees part of the Viking Staff Share Trust.	
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			Registration with commissioner not audited although instructed through Q & R to do so.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
Total Insured: 70,320.00 Insured per ton: 23,710.83	Turnover per ton: R20 198.43	Applicant has undertaken research and is also part of various organisation who undertake research.	
General Comments:		Enterprise Development:	
Investment in processing and value adding.	Work with HDP companies in joint ventures		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
			Viking Group				
6.3.1	50% black – 20% female	55% black, 22% female					
6.3.2		100% black					
6.4.1	24.3% black	47.36% black, 2% female					
6.5 (T&SM)	62.68% black	57% black – 9.5 female					
6.5 (p)	49.31% black, 3.4% female	44% black – 3.4 female					
11.2	Y	N	See above, joint ventures not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00011 - SNOEK WHOLESALERS (PROPRIETARY) LIMITED	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant part of Snoek Wholesaler Group. Jobs and Investment not apportioned.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Totals of 6.4.1 and 8.1.1 not the same.		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
Total employees not the same as 8.1.1. No explanations			
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		See below. Information not apportioned and therefore unreliable.	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	18. Fishing Plan (S13)
See below. Information not apportioned and therefore not reliable.	Turnover per ton – R3566		Has not indicated overall ability in Fishing Plan.
General Comments:			
Reliance: Answered “yes” to reliance on other entities, no details provided.	Rights of access to suitable vessel: Catching Agreement only for 2005 fishing season.		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
Vessel access	Y	N	Catching Agreement only for 2005 season				
8.1.1 (IRP5)	322	0	Information not apportioned, unreliable.				
8.1.3 (Total)	322	0	Information not apportioned, unreliable.				
8.1.3 (Total less seasonal)	322	0	Information not apportioned, unreliable.				
8.1.3 (per ton)	0.51	0	Information not apportioned, unreliable.				
8.1.2	21 808	0	Wage bill per ton will have to be 0 as employees reduced to 0.				
9.1.2	R22 700 000.00	0	Information not apportioned, unreliable.				
11.1	Y	N	No proper explanation of how applicant value adds				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00012 - J ENGELBRECHT VISSERYE CC	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant has 10% share in Snoek Wholesalers who in turn owns 100% of the MFV Millennium. Applicant also holds 18.75% share in MFV Bloudam who is in a Joint Venture Agreement with Premier Fishing. This vessel is used in WCRL. Applicant owns the MFV "Vea", a pelagic vessel.		2002 – under caught by 15.20% as the vessel suffered significant engine problems	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Applicant claims 5 employees. Not clear where fifth employee comes from. See Annexure 8.A		0
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
	IRP5 – 0 = 0 per ton Total – 1 Permanent – 1		
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries & responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R326.01		

General Comments:

Reliance: Catching and processing by Snoek Wholesalers Marketing – Snoek Wholesalers			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
11.1	Y	N	Investment in factory vessel not value adding.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00013 - Mayibuye Fishing (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Relationship with Capensis Investment(inshore trawl) Chetty’s Fisheries and Capensis relationship.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Q.6.6.1 = 4 top & Snr managers 6.5 = 5 top & Snr managers		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
More than 50% owner of vessel.	Turnover per ton: R9 170,30		
General Comments:			
<u>Investment:</u> Annex 1A states that in 2004 Appl. Purchased vessel & refurbished it. However, S9 does not reflect any insured value & harbour & sea based assets (9.14)		<u>Reliance:</u> Appl. Has 2 catching agreements (pays catching & processing fees)	<u>Medical Aid (Employee benefits)</u> Only 11 of the 58 (claimed) employees get medical (annexure 6D)

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
S.6.21	Y	N	Auditor states that there’s no evidence that Training Report & Skills plan have been submitted.				
Access to vessel	Y	Y	Vessel can carry 23 crew members and is 30m long. The vessel has been marked as not suitable in score sheet and this should be amended.				
11.1	Y	N	No clear explanation of value adding initiatives.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	Adcom 1: Cheslyn
Application Name and Number: HDSM00014 - VISKO SEA PRODUCTS (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant and ZWM Fishing holds the major share in vessel company Basani Marine	3.1.4 Director of applicant charged under MLRA for catching sardines and anchovy without a permit		
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Applicant gives detail for 191 employees. Information not clear and unreliable. In section 8, applicant claims no employees for this sector. However, from Annexure 1A it appears as if applicant merged all employees for this purpose.		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
Salary bands do not correspond with top salary earners. Employee earning between R30 000 – R40 000 not reflected. Skipper earning R301 065 not reflected in Salary Band			
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5, Permanent & Total: 0 jobs – no jobs claimed in application form by applicant. Apportionment, if any, not explained.	Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries & responses
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R3 266	14.3	
General Comments:		Value Adding	
Reliance: Catching was done by Basani Marine (medium term rights period). Long term rights period applicants catching, processing and marketing will be done by Basani Marine	Auditors Report: Section 5.1 – Auditor could not test 2 months in 2002, 2003 2004 because there are no supporting documentation Section 6.3.2 – For a lot of workers there are no physical ID's because most are on sea and the skipper does not ask for a copy thereof	Applicant adds value by heading, cleaning, filleting and sorting fish on board the MFV and thereafter packing it into carton boxes.	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
14.4	Y	N	Applicant pays levies on catches landed				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00015 - Quayside Fish Suppliers (Cape) (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Part of Viking Group, but has mentioned in 1A that it does not rely on info from other entities, except its holding company.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
		Different from 6.5 info	Different from 6.5 info
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			S7.9 not audited but this was never requested in the Agreed Upon Proceedings but was instructed to audit it in the Q&R's.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
General Comments:			
		EEFA Compliance: Has answered YES to 6.1 and 6.2.2. Can only be one of both	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.2.2	Y	N	Can't be designated employer and voluntary comply.				
6.3.2	2/3 Black – 66%	1/3 Black – 32%	Merged with its subsidiary and said it only relies on its Holding company's info where necessary.				
6.4.1	46/100% Black – 46%	¼ Black – 25%	Said they have not relied on other entities in application				
6.5(T &Snr and M)	42/47 Black – 59.6%	5/9 Black – 55.55%	Said they have not relied on other entities in application				
6.5 (Prof)	36/73 Black – 49.3%	0/2 Black – 0%	Said they have not relied on other entities in application				
6.3.1	6/11 Black – 54.5%	4/7 Black – 57.19%	Merged only with Holding company(Board of Directors)				
11.1	Y	N	Operation in form of joint venture not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00016 - ZWM FISHING (PTY) LTD			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Connected to the vessel owning Company Basani Marine Consider together with Visko Seeprodukte		Under catch in 2002 of 17.32%. Reason: Refit of vessel to become suitable to operate in SA waters.	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Employment Equity information unclear – not reliable but it seems as if all the employees of Visko Seeprodukte and ZWM Fishing were listed.		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Applicants have claimed no employees in the form; however they have a share in a vessel. Apportionment if any, not explained.	Section 7.9 – has not been audited. This was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but was an instruction in the Queries & responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S12)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	R3879.23 per ton turnover		

General Comments:

Reliance: Catching, Marketing and Processing will be done by Basani Marine (Pty) Ltd		EEA Compliance: Applicant claims it is not a designated employer but turnover according to AFS is over 2 million.	
---	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
14.4	Y	N	Applicant contends that it pays levies to the Department				
6.1	N	Y	See EEA Compliance above.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: C D	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00017 - SELECTA SEA PRODUCTS (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant only relies on its and holding co's info; not sister co's or JV partners' info. Part of Viking Group of companies			5. 60% B 20% W
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
0% B Annex 6B 0% F _____ see comment below	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
			4. 25% B } Annexure 6F 0% F } see below for comment
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			CODA registration (Commissioner) not audited
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton R25 683.59		

General Comments:

Transformation info:
Merged info [applicant & Holding co.]

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
S6.5(top & Snr man)	67	6	Applicant claims 67 top & Snr management in form but only 6 in Annexure 6F				
			Annex 1A states that applicant only relies on its & holding co's information and no other entities'				
S.6.5(professionals)	73	4	Applicant claims 73 professionals in applications form but is allocated 4 in Annex 6F. Applicant only relying on its & holding co's info(Annex1A)				
6.4.1	Total B F 100 46 3		Applicant claims 100 top salary earners in application form (6.4.1) but allocated only 3 in 6C(none of whom are black or female). Annex 1A states that applicant only relying on it's and holding co's info				
11.1	Y	N	Involvement in JV not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn
Application Name and Number: HDSM00018 - Siyaloba Fishing Enterprises (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant part of Viking Group (100% owned by Viking Fishing Holdings), with other applicants Viking Fishing, New South Africa Fishing Enterprises, Hangberg, Anglo Mar, Quaside Fish Suppliers, Sistro Trawling	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) 46/100 = 46%	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) IRP5 – 22 Total – 22 Permanent – 22	14. Safety (S7) Section 7.9 – registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries and Responses
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover Per Ton: R7820	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
General Comments:			
Reliance: No reliance			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.4.1	928	23	Merged data of Viking Group used by Applicant while only 23 employees = applicant's				
	46% black	91.3% black					
6.3.1	7/11 = 64%	3/5 = 60%	Not merged properly with whole group only with Holding Company				
6.2.2	Y	N	Applicant is a designated employer and complied and therefore could not comply voluntarily				
6.5 top & senior	42/67 = 62.6%	4/6 = 66.66%	Applicant's Top & Senior Management only				
6.5 Professionals	36/73 = 49%	2/2 = 100%	Applicant's professionals only				
11.2	Y	N	Involvement in JV not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00019 - Sistro Trawling (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Part of Viking Group of Companies, but has said that it is applying alone, not as a JV.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			S7.9 has not been audited. It was left out of the Agreed Upon Procedures but was requested that it be audited in the Queries and Responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	18. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R12 653		

General Comments:

EEA Compliance: Applicant has answered "yes" to being designated as well as having voluntarily complied. Can only be one of both.			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.2.2	Y	N	See reason under EEA Compliance.				
6.3.1	7/ ? Black - 63.7%	3/5 black – 60%	Merged Board of Directors with Holding Company only.				
6.5. (T &SM)	42/67 Black – 59.6%	3/5 black – 60%	Merged with Viking Group, applicant applying alone.				
6.5 (Prof)	36/73 black – 49.3%	8/14 black – 57.2%	Merged with Viking Group, applicant applying alone.				
6.4.1	46/100 black – 46%	5/7 black – 46.7%	Merged with Viking Group, applicant applying alone.				
11.2	Y	N	Involvement in JV not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00020 - Hangberg Fishing Company (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant is part of the Viking Group. In Annex 1A applicant provides in submitting the application is not relying on any information from sister companies/JV companies/partners except holding co.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) Applicant merges its info with that of the Holding Co.(Viking Holding) Amended data to only appli. Info 66% Black No Females
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
		Amended to applicant information only. 66% Black No Females	Amended to applicant information only. 0%
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
		It appears applicants' employees have share in the holding company – Viking Holdings through the Viking Staff Share Trust.	
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Apportioned - IRP5 = 57 > 0.047 per ton - Total = 57 > 0.047 per ton - Permanent = 57 > 0.047 pr ton	Registration with commissioner not audited although instructed to do so through Q&R
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
		Participate in various organisations that undertake research.	Covers all the matters required in the schedules

General Comments:			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.1	66% Black 16% Female	66% Black 0% Female	Amended to reject applicant information. See above				
6.3.2	100% Black	100% Black 0% Female					
6.4.1	24.3% Black	100% Black	Viking applicants do not apply as unit				
6.5(T&S)	62.68% Black	66% Black 0% Female					
6.5(Prof)	49.31% Black	0% Black 0% Female					
8.1.3	0.05% Black	0.047%	Employees per ton should not be rounded up				
6.2.2	Y	N	Applicant is a designated employer, period!				
11.2	Y	N	Enterprise development not recognised as it consists of involvement in JV's				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00024 - Irvin & Johnson Ltd	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 - 1958 = 0.04 Per Ton Total – 3065 Permanent – 2250	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R18 288.07		

General Comments:

Reliance: Catching agreement with Ntshonalanga Fishing to establish Iyagasi Fishing. Processing – during 2004 when employees went on strike action			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.7.1	38.75	36.85%	Applicant claimed that Mast Fishing was 85% black while Mast Fishing according to its own application in SCRL said that they are 71% black.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn
Application Name and Number: HDSM00026 - ANGLO MAR FISHING RIGHTS COMPANY (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant part of Viking Group with Viking Fishing, New South African Fishing Enterprises, Hangberg, Quayside Fish Suppliers, Sistro Trawling and Siyalaba Fishing.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) 2002 – 100% under catch since applicant only granted 2002 right under appeal	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) See note below
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5) See comment below	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) See note below	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) IRP5 – 54 = 0.15 per ton Total – 74 Permanent – 54	14. Safety (S7) Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries & responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover per ton: R15 813 12.3 – Annexure 12C – setting aside of provisional liquidation order	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:

Reliance: Applicant said "no"			
----------------------------------	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.1	5/9 = 55%	3/5 = 60%	Not merged properly with the whole group only with the Holding Company				
6.4.1	46/100 = 46%	2/7 = 28.57%	Applicants salary bands only				
6.5 top & Senior	42/167 = 62.6%	4/7 = 57.14%	Applicant's top & Senior Management				
6.5 Professionals	36/73 = 49%	3/8 = 37.5%	Applicant's professionals only				
11.2	Y	N	Involvement in JV not enterprise development				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation accepted				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00027 - NEW SOUTH AFRICA FISHING ENTERPRISES (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Part of the Viking Group. Relies on info of sister co’s, JV partners and holding co’s			58.33%B 16.66%B
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
100%B 0%F	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
46% B 3% F in top 6 levels			
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP 66	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R6 651.63		
General Comments:			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
Q. 6.22	Y	Y	Applicant answered YES to 6.21 – 6.23 but is not scored positively in score sheet				
11.2	Y	N	Involvement in JV is not recognised as enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00028 - COMBINED FISHING ENTERPRISES CC	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Claims to 100% Black% black-owned, independent, 100% Black% black managed 100% Black% of its own trawler. Currently involved in HDST, HLL, and Small Pelagic.		In 2003 Applicant under caught by 13% as the vessel was not viable as a wet fish vessel and spent 3 months changing the vessel to a factory freezer vessel	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
Top salary earner not reflected in salary bands. Information unreliable. 3 rd highest salary earner also not reflected in 6.4.1. No annexure 6A provided	Applicant claims 46 employees. Not clear where employees comes from		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 – 14 = 0.02 per ton Total – 31 – not clear how total employees calculated Permanent - 24	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R5 590.48		
General Comments:			
Reliance: Catching Agreement with I & J	Audit Report: Audit Report = 1 page letter	Will also apply for SP, HLL, WCRL Offshore	Investment in factory freezer vessel.

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
5.1	Y	N	Explanation for under-catch in 2003 acceptable				
8.1.3(total incl. seasonal)	31	24	No explanation why 31 and not 24 (as in annexure 8A)				
11.2	Y	N	Association with another company not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00029 - BLUE CONTINENT PRODUCTS (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
100% owned subsidiary of Oceana. Also shareholder of Compass Trawling JV		Capacity constraints on vessel & poor fishing conditions in 2002. Under-caught by 20%. Applied to FEAC to use another vessel, this caused further delays.	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Reduction of Realeka should be 48% (not 41%) but this makes no difference.	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R10 084		

General Comments:

Reliance: Pays management fee Oceana, but not clear what the amount is as it differs from application form to annexure.			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable for under-catching in 2002				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00030 - CALAMARI FISHING (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) 100% owned by Blue Continent Products who in turn are owned by Oceana 100%	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) Under-caught in 2002. Hull. Survey was carried out during Feb/March 2002, poor fishing conditions in Eastern Cape during 2002.	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) Information only merged for OGL and applicant not BCP as well.
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) Information only merged for OGL and applicant not BCP as well.	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5) Big difference with 6.4.1	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) Big difference with 6.5	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7) 7.8 not answered.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover per ton R23 387.00 (seems high)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:			
Reliance: Management and marketing done by BCP and ultimately by Oceana	Auditors: Unable to sight the 2003 fishing permit		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.1	5.14 black – 35.71%	0%					
6.3.2	1/6 black 16.66%	0%					
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00032 - NOORDKAAP VISSERMAN ONDERNEMING LTD			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
DMA holds 67% share in Aquatic Fish which in turn holds 39% of appl. Right holder in HDST and HLL	Convicted ito MLRA but no annexure explaining.	Under-catch(37.13%) in 2002 No annexure explaining.	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Q6.5 – 2 professionals (50%B ; 0%F) 6.6.2 – 4 professionals (75%B;)%F)		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		No annex 8A explaining the jobs	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
More than 50% owner of two vessels	Turnover per ton: R17,78		

General Comments:

<u>EE Act</u> Appl's turnover = R11 932 157 but Appl did not submit skills plan and Training report	<u>Compliance:</u> Appl. answers YES to conviction of a contravention of MLRA(3.1.1) but no annexure	<u>Reliance:</u> Appl. Pays 386% of turnover to Fish Online cc for marketing	<u>Ownership</u> No annexure 6G explaining shareholding.
--	---	---	---

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
Q.6.4.2	Y	N	Annex 6E shows death / permanent disablement benefit but no medical aid and pension benefits. No Annex 6D attached.				
Access to vessel	Y	Y					
11.2	Y	N	Joint venture, building of fish shops / small restaurant not enterprise development.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00033 - Sea Harvest Corporation Ltd	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Holds 100% share of Atlantic Trawling	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R11 881,49		
General Comments:			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
Q.6.21 - 6.23	Y	Y	Although Appl. Answer YES to procurement, a positive score was not entered in the score sheet				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH) AdCom 1: MR
 Application Name and Number: HDSM00034 - HOXIES (PTY) LTD AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant is part of the MFV Marie Claire operation JV with: Community Workers Fernpar		The Marie Claire vessel under caught by 16.41% because: 1) Main engine problems 2) Loss of life of 2 crew members 3) Poor catch rates for HDST in 2002	Merged with MFV Marie Claire No females. 62.5% black.
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
Merged with Marie Claire. No females. Do not correspond with salary bands. 81% black – possibly amend to 0% black.	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	With respect to 6.5 applicant and Community Workers have the same information whilst Fernpar is different although using the same vessel?	Merged with MFV Marie Claire	
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
Merged MFV Marie Claire. Do not correspond with top salary earners. 5.88% female 76% black – possibly amend to 0% black	10% female 100% black	None	
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Jobs apportion and per quota. Applicant has claimed information of employees not involved in the sector. Only applicant's share of Marie Claire recognised. IRP5 – 266 – Amend to 9 = 0.018 per ton Total – 17.19 – amend to 17 = 0.03 per ton Permanent – 17.19 – amend to 17 = 0.03 per ton	S7.9 not audited although through Q & R they were instructed to have it audited in the absence of such an instruction in the Agreed Upon Procedures.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
Apportioned by applicant	Turnover per ton R6 818.59	None undertaken.	
General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicant appears to be paying a catching fee to the MFV Marie Claire. It appears that also a marketing fee is paid to the MFV Marie Claire. Applicant claims to participate in the management.			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.1	266 IRP5 jobs	9 – 0.018 per ton	Applicant has provided information not involved in the sector [9 is applicants share in the vessel]				
8.1.3	17.19 Total Employees	17 – 0.0.3 per ton					
8.1.3	31.00 Total less seasonal	17 – 0.0.3 per ton					
8.1.1	19,116,535	650,522.00 [1352.26]	Wage bill not apportioned (see 8.1.2)				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable				
11.2	Y	N	Investment in Marie Claire not enterprise development, fish supply to JV partners not enterprise development.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00035 - Atlantic Trawling (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant is 100% owned by Sea Harvest			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	6.5 = 2 142 employees 6.4.1 = 1 976 employees		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R11 878.31		

General Comments:

Reliance: Appl relies on Sea Harvest (all the operation are merged and integrated)			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.2.1	Y	Y	Score sheet has not recorded appl. having a Procurement Policy				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00037 - Foodcorp (Pty) Ltd			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Marine Products the division for Foodcorp			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R14 655.00		

General Comments:

Access to suitable vessel: One of the nominated vessels is still to b acquired.			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.3 (p/ton)	34.12	0.029	Applicant seems to have got calculation wrong.				
11.2	Y	N	Assisting smaller right holders in catching and landing quotas and berthing and servicing assistance not enterprise develop				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00038 - RAINBOW NATION FISHING CC			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Appl holds 30% share in Xhantlomzi (Pty) Ltd (vessel owning co.). Owners of Codesa1. Appl relies on jobs & investment of vessel owning company. Applicant holds 40% stake in Umoya Fishing (Pty) Ltd. Applicant bought equity of Helderberg Kommersiele Visserman Vereniging.			28.57% B 0%F
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
66.66% B 0% F	Q 6.5 = 3 professionals (66.66%B and 0% F) 6.6.2 = 4 professionals (100%)		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 = 3 employees Apportioned between applicant and Usuthu.	COIDA registration – not audited
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
Divided between applicant and Usuthu.	Turnover per ton: R9 005,71		

General Comments:

MLRA: Appl. Paid admission of guilt fine for over-catching by-catch(Kingklip)	Turnover: Applicant’s certified annual turnover(12.1) is less than turnover derived in this fishery(12.2)	Reliance: Appl. Pays catching and processing fees to Xhantlomzi.[Appl. Holds 30% shares in Xhantlomzi]	
--	--	---	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
14.4	Y	N	No proof of research sponsored appl only states that it pays levies				
11.1	Y	N	Insufficient explanation of value adding				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00039 - BHANA COASTAL FISHING CC	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant is in a JV / economic unit with Azanian Fishing, BCP, Surmon & Trachurus / Luzizi Fishing. Applicant owns 13.37% of Compass Trawling. Owns a percentage of Compass Challenger.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) In 2002 the applicant under caught by 70.41%. This was as a result of poor fishing conditions and capacity constraints.	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) Not merged with Compass Trawling. 16% female. Recommended amendment: 83% black.
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) Applicant does not have its own employees except those of JV. Does not correspond with salary band (6.4.1). No females 100% black	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) No top / senior management in 2004 & 2005 0%	Professionals (S6.6.2) Total no. employees not corresponding with number of total employees in the vessel. Information not reliable. Recommended amendment 0%.
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) Does not correspond with top salary earners. 6.3.2 not clear why applicant has 17 employees – because if applying as part of JV it should have 52 employees and if only as applicant it should be 0 employees since applicant has no employees. Recommended amendment = 0%	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8) 50% female 100% black	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8) none	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) In application form applicant claims all the JV's employees and does not apportion them. IRP5 = 6 – 0.01 per ton Total = 7 – 0.01 per ton Permanent = 7 – 0.01 per ton	14. Safety (S7) Registration with Commissioner not audited although instructed to do so by Q & R after such an instruction was left out in Agreed Upon Procedures.
15. Investment (S9) Total insured: amended from 35 million to R4 682,966	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover per ton: R10 077	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12) None	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicants as individuals and not pay any fees to the JV Compass Trawling but the JV Compass Trawling pays fees to BCP for Marketing and management.	Other fishing rights: Horse Mackerel	Audit Report: Auditors report page 2 & 3 does not agree with applicants Vat number and skill development number.	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.1	IRP5 – 46	6 (0.012 per ton)	Applicant's percentage of IRP5 jobs 13.37 of 46 (from Surmon's Application form)				
8.1.2	Wage R646,638.00	R646.158.99 (R1,297,50) per ton claim					
9.1.2	R35 000 000.00	R4 682 966	Application apportioned total insured value.				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH) AdCom 1:
 Application Name and Number: HDSM00040 - NTSNONALANGA FISHING (PTY) LTD AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Have a JV with I & J called Igagasi. Relying of information from this entity.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5) Only 2 employees in categories but 14 in levels.	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Table 8.1.1 and 8.1.3 are substantially different. No explanation in annexure, not clear whether properly	S7.9 not audited.
15. Investment (S9) Bought vessel (50%) MFV Alloc, with loan from I&J. No annexure, not clear whether properly apportioned.	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13) Does not cover areas to be targeted.
General Comments:			
Reliance: Says "yes" in 6.7.6, but has not filled out 6.7.7. Management, marketing & catching done by Igagasi & I&J. Processing by I&J.			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.3 (total)	31	5	Claim that in 8.1.1, 8.1.3 should be the same				
8.1.3 (Perm)	31	5	Claim that in 8.1.1, 8.1.3 should be the same				
8.1.3 (per ton)	0.04	0.01	Due to amendments to total 8 permanent jobs				
7.14	Y	N	Garbage Management Plan very vague, lacks detail				
6.1	N	Y	Turnover according to AFS is above 2 million				
6.2.2	Y	N	Designated employer – cannot comply voluntary				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00041 - SURMON FISHING (PTY) LTD.	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Part of Compass Trawling JV.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R2486.00		Fishing Plan has little information. Silent on fishing days, overall ability and issues required in schedule 13.

General Comments:

Reliance: Applicants quota caught processed and marketed by Compass Trawling. Applicant pays a management and marketing fee to Blue Continent Products.			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.2.2	Y	N	Auditors report do not clearly indicate whether applicant voluntarily complied with EEA Act.				
6.3.1	5/5 = 100% black	7/9 = 77.77% Black	Applicants apply as a JV but neglected to merge in application form.				
6.4.1	22 (total)	0	Information unreliable, have included members who were not included in 8.1.1.				
6.5	19 (totals)	0	Information unreliable, have included members who were not included in 8.1.1.				
8.1.1 (IRP5)	18	15	Only recognising sea based jobs				
8.1.1 (total)	20	17	Only recognising sea based jobs				
8.1.1 (Perm)	20	17	Only recognising sea based jobs				
8.1.1	Per ton0		Stays the same on re-calculation.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH) | AdCom 1: Cheslyn
 Application Name and Number: HDSM00042 - Offshore Fishing Company(Pty) Ltd | AdCom 2: HK | Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant 100% owned by Sizwe Fishing Investments	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) 2002 – undercaught by 38,11% because applicant had difficulty in finding suitable partner to catch its fish quota. 2004 – undercaught by 33.60% because applicant was in process to purchase own vessel and only started late catching quota	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 – 2 – 0,0002 Per ton Total – 2 Permanent – 2 Claim no employees in 8.1.2 and 8.1.3	
15. Investment (S9) Balance owing n vessel 18.2 million Net investment in HDST vessel = 7.5 million rand. More than 50% vessel owner but claim no investment in section 9 of the form.	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover per ton R4 421,74	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13) Applicant does not demonstrate overall ability and also does not provide detailed vessel information
General Comments:			
Reliance: Catching, Processing and marketing of 2004 quota facilitated by Steve Kruger	EE Compliance: See note below	Audit Report: No Audit report submitted	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.2.2	Y	N	Applicant is a designated employer and therefore cannot comply voluntarily				
6.3.2	100%	0	Not clear and does not correspond with 6.4.1				
14.2	Y	N	No Annexure provided by applicant				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH) | Adcom 1:
 Application Name and Number: HDSM00043 - USUTHU FISHING CC | Adcom 2: HK | Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Appl holds 30% in vessel owning co. and relies on info from the said co.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) 50%B 0%F
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5) Q. 6.5 = 18 employees 6.4.1 = 16 employees	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) Q.6.5 = 2 professional but 6.6.2 = 3 professional employees 3/5 - 60% B 2/5 - 40% F	Professionals (S6.6.2) 1/3 - 33.33% B 0% F
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) 100% B 0% F	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8) 70% B 0% F	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8) No share scheme	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) IRP5 = 5 Total = 16 Permanent = 16	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover: Whole: 247 456 Hake: 2 986 835 Per ton: 8 741.64 SEE COMMENT BELOW	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13) Detail of vessel not included

General Comments:

Financial Performance: * Note that total turnover is much less than the turnover generated from this fishery.	Reliance: Appl. Pays Xhantilomzi Fishing for catching and processing. [Appl. Holds 30% share in Xhantilomzi]	Wage Bill: 8.1.1 reflects - 1 128 061 8.1.2 reflects - 1 243 136	Part of Xhantilomzi operating company. Assess with Rainbow Nation and Umoya Fishing
---	---	---	---

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
S14.4	Y	N	Appl. Monitors specialist fishing publications and attends appropriate conferences – no indication of actual sponsoring of any research				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00044 - TRADEFORTH 13 (PTY) LTD			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Has share in vessel – Ukhozi in which Koi Qua also have a share. Applicant holds 19.2 shares out of 64 shares. No explanation in annexure 1A of how applicant applies. Access to vessel through catching agreement.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton = R2008		

General Comments:

Reliance: Applicant answered “yes” to reliance on other entities, but provides no detail.			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.1 (IRP5)	23	0	No explanation in Annexures as to where employees come from.				
8.1.3 (Total)	24	0	No explanation in Annexures as to where employees come from.				
8.1.3 (perm)	24	0	No explanation in Annexures as to where employees come from.				
8.1.3 (p/ton)	20.77	0	No explanation in Annexures as to where employees come from.				
6.3.1	¾ black – 75%	0%	No explanation in Annexures , information unreliable.				
6.3.2	2/2 black 100%	0%					
6.5	1	0%	Table unreliable, no explanation in annexures.				
6.4.1	24	0	Table unreliable, no explanation in annexures.				
8.1.2	1344.96(wage p/t)	0	Have reduced employees to 0 so then wage bill must be 0.				
11.1	Y	N	Insufficient explanation of value adding.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: MR
Application Name and Number: HDSM00045 - KHOI QWA FISHING DEVELOPMENT COMPANY (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant is a co owner of Ukhozi vessel with Tradeforth & Protea. Holds 19.2 shares out of 64 shares in a vessel.. Consider with Tradeforth application.			No detail provided. 50% female 100% black
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
Have shareholders as employees. 50% female – amend to 0% female 100% black – amend to 0% black	Occupational Categories (S6.5) WRT transformation the applicant does not provide any further information in annexures.	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) 0%	Professionals (S6.6.2) Professionals earn less than R2500 pm 33.33% female 100% black
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
All the employees earn less than R2500 pm. 100% black	37.50 female 100% black	1	
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 = 0 Total employees = 18 > 0.03 per ton Permanent = 18 > 0.03 per ton No annexures provided, cannot workout how many employees in the vessel. Possibly amend to 0%	Registration with Commissioner not audited although instruction was given later that it should be audited per Q & R.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
No annexure provided – cannot workout how calculated investment: Total insured: R 1433,864 Insure per ton: R2 882.05	Turnover per ton: R1886.21	Applicant replied “yes” to section 14.4 because it pays levies to MCM.	

General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicant answered “yes” in section 6.7.6 but provides no detail in 6.7.7 or annexure.			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
14.4	Y	N	Applicant provides that it pays levies to MCM.				
8.1.1	IRP5 JOBS = 18	0	No explanation where employees are from or apportionment with Tradeforth				
8.1.3	Total = 18	0	No explanation where employees are from or apportionment with Tradeforth				
8.1.3	Total less seasonal = 18	0	No explanation where employees are from or apportionment with Tradeforth				
8.1.2	341 848	0	No explanation of salary bill				
6.3.1	100%	0	No explanation of economic unit / merger				
6.3.2	100%	0	No explanation of composition of economic unit				
6.5	100%	0	No explanation of composition of economic unit				
6.4.1	100%	0	No explanation of composition of economic unit				
11.1	Y	N	Insufficient explanation of value adding				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00046 - J&J Visserye BK			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Operating together with Ukhozi Fishing. Rely on some of their information		Under 2004 – 100%. Vessel from Namibia, long delay in certification.	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries & responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
Claims no investment but seems clear from Annexure 1A that applicant has made investment.	No turnover generated from this fishery according to 12.2		

General Comments:

--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.1 (IRP5)	2	0	Included no employees in 8.1.3, but 8.1.1 has employees, seems these are only land based and applicant did not regard them as operating in the fishery (wage bill per ton already 0)				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable				
11.2	Y	N	Selling vessel not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00050 - BAYVIEW FISHING (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Related to Viking Group of Companies through Bayking Fishing	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		Totals for 8.1.1 and 8.1.3 are largely different. Probably as 8.1.1 includes employees in other sectors.	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:

Reliance: Answered "no" to reliance even though it is part of the Viking Group of companies.	Auditors Report: Auditors did not audit from page 5 of audit report.		
---	---	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.2 – S15	-	-	None of the sections audited cannot rely on information				
8.1.3 (per ton)	18	0.046	Applicant performed calculation wrong				
8.1.1 (IRP5)	32	28	Applicant can't have more than what is claimed in 8.1.1				
S9	All amounts	0	Auditors disagree with amounts				
6.3.2	3/3 = 100%	0%	Auditors disagree				
6.4.2	Y	N	No annexure provided				
6.2.1	Y	N	Not audited				
6.4.1	44	0	Not Audited				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	AdCom 2: HK	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00052 - Eyethu Fishing (Pty) Ltd			

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant controlled by Pioneer Fishing through combined shareholding of 3 shareholders i.e. Pioneer Fishing (East Coast), SACO Fishing and G&T Fishing Enterprise. Consider also with Ziyabuya Fishing (Eastern Cape) and Pioneer Fishing Eastern Cape.			See note below. 7/11 Merge problematic.
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
7/9 black, merger problematic	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Only 244 employees	See note below 6/9 black, problematic merger.	See note below 4/4 Not clear whether information merged properly.
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 – 23 = 0.07 per ton Total 23 Permanent = 23	Wage Bill R1,3 m apportioned
			Sect. 1.9 Applicant registered and not audited since it was not in the Agree Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Q&R's
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
Owns the vessels Arctic, Marretje and Zuiderzee, catch allocation of Saco Fishign and G & T Fishing	Turnover per ton: R14 858.60		

General Comments:

No reliance			
-------------	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
Sect. 8 IRP5	303	23	Employees merged for applicant and JV partners for all sectors applying				
8.11 Wage Bill	R18 093 068	R1 373 401 3919,64 per ton	Third quarter of 2005, assisted owner to set up a fish shop – not long enough involvement. Wage Bill should be apportioned.				
11.2	Y	N					

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn
Application Name and Number: HDSM00056 - Fernpar Fishing Company (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Owned 61% by Lusitania Trawling Services	2. Compliance (S3) Section 3.2 Seizure – vessel Sandile in which applicant holds 10% share	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) In 2002 applicant had 52% under catching. Reasons: Tragic accident, Engine Problems & unforeseen poor catch rates	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) Does not correspond with 6.4.1	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) Does not correspond with 6.3.2	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation – Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) IRP5 – 93 – 0.04 Total – 132 Permanent – 94 Wage Bill – R8 656 452	14. Safety (S7) Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but Applicants were advised to do so in the Queries and Responses
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover Per Ton – R10 176	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:			
Reliance: Management – Pays supervision and administration fee to African Marine	EE Compliance: See note below		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.2	100%	0	Not reliant and does not correspond with 6.4.1				
6.4.1	100%	0	Not reliant and does not correspond with 6.3.2. Two employees earning between R30 000 – R40 000 and employee earning more than R60 000 not reflected in 6.3.2				
6.4.2	Y	N	Medical cover of Lusitania Group not applicant – no details provided as requested in Annexure 6D				
6.1	N	Y	Applicant said “no” to being designated but turnover is more than R2 million				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable				
11.2	Y	N	Assisting smaller right holders to invest not enterprise development				
3.2	Y	N	Matter pending.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00057 - Algoa Bay Sea Products (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK
	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Part of Lusitania Trawling JV with Fernpar and Algoa Sea Products.	"yes" to 3.2. Confiscation and seizure of vessel – Sandile. Applicant has interest in Ntlanzi who in turn has interest in Sandile.	Under caught by 13% in 2002 due to generally poor catch rates.	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
Not exact correspondence between 6.4.1 and 6.3.2, but close enough.	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries & responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Total turnover is less than turnover for fishery. Turnover as per AFS in 12A lower than that in application form.		

General Comments:			
Reliance: Has processing agreement with other members of the JV. Donna Maria Ligia Lusitania Trawling 70% shareholder, Move-on-up 103 and Crew Trust hold rest.			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.18	Y	N	No detail of benefiting organisations provided.				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable				
11.2	Y	N	Assisting smaller companies to invest, not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00058 - Radaco Sea Products (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant part of Lusitania Trawling JV together with Fernpar and Algoa Bay Sea Products		Under caught in 2002 due to vessel break down (17%)	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
See note below			
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 – 20 – 0.028 per ton Total – 36 Permanent – 20	Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but Applicants were advised to do so in the Queries and Responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton – R10 409		
General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicant pays management fees to African Marine and pro rata shares in nominated vessel (Emile Adrien)			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.4.1	2/2 = 100%	0	Not clear since no annexure provided and two employees earning between R25 001 – R30 000 and R30 001 – R40 000 not reflected in table 6.3.2				
6.3.2	2/4 = 50%	0	Not merged properly – information unreliable and does not correspond with 6.4.1				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable				
11.2	Y	N	Assisting smaller companies to invest, not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00064 - AZANIAN FISHING (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant part of compass JV together with other right holder applicants – BCP, Bhana, Luzizi and Surmon		See comment below	
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5- 7 = 0.11 per ton Total – 8 Permanent – 8	Section 7.9 – Applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but applicants were advised to do so in the Queries & responses
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: 10 077		
General Comments:			
Reliance: No Reliance	Transformation: 6.4.2 Medical Aid contributions see note below		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
5.1	N	Y	Other applicants using same vessel answered “yes” to under-catching. Under caught by 68% [poor fishing conditions] No explanation offered				
6.5	1/1 = 100%	3/3 = 100%	Top management not merged properly in application form				
6.4.1	56	0	Not clear and does not correspond with 6.3.2				
6.3.2	2/2 = 100%	0	Two top salary earners not reflected in section 6.4.1				
14.4	Y	N	Annexure provided by applicant not clear on research undertaken by applicant				
6.4.2	Y	N	Applicant only provides cover for accidental or traumatic exposure to HIV				
11.2	Y	N	CV of Mr William Lewis not enterprise development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00065 - Bato Star Fishing (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
	3.2 The nominated vessel(the Sandile) was seized		
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	8.1.1 reflects 59 Employees 6.4.1 reflects 53 employees		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			COIDA - The registration with the commissioner is not audited.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R6 877.09		

General Comments:			
EE Act: Appl's turnover = R6875 965 but appl. did not comply with EE (submit training report or skills plan)	Compliance: Seizure of vessel: Appl. Disputing some of the grounds in seizure notice.		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
3.2	Y	N	Dispute about by-catch contravention pending admit minor contravention (no notification of MCM of vessel docking).				
11.2	Y	N	Investment in vessels not enterprise development.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)3/10/05 CHESLYN
 Application Name and Number: HDSM00069 - Ziyabuya Fishing (Eastern Cape) (Pty) Ltd
 AdCom 1:
 AdCom 2: HK
 Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Shareholder in Eyethu Fishing and in JV with Monose(?) Fishing to catch, process and market appliant's quota	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) Under caught in 202 by 47,6% due to vessel breakdown	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) See below
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) See below	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5) See below	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) See below	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) IRP5 – 0 Total – 8 Permanent - 8	14. Safety (S7) Section 7.9 – applicant registered with Commissioner not audited since it was not in the Agreed Upon Procedures for Auditors but Applicant's were advised to do so in the Q&R's.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:

Reliance: Applicant said YES but Annexure 6J not clear	EEA Compliance: Not designated employer since their turnover as per the financial statement is less than R2m		
--	---	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.1.	8/8 =100%	0	Directors not merged properly with Eyethu Fishing Group 17/23 = 73.91%				
6.3.2	8/8 =100%	0	Applicant gave all 8 members in application form. Not merged with Eyethu Group				
6.4.1	8/8 =100%	0	Not merged properly and completed incorrectly as 8 members earn between R30 000 – R40 000 according to the table. Top salary earners in Annexure 6B not listed				
6.5. Top Snr	8/8 =100%	0	Not merged properly in Application form. 8 Members also Top & Sen. managers. Applicant only				
Professionals	0%	0	Not merged with Eyethu Fishing in application form (Merged 4/4 = 100% Black%				
11.2	Y	N	Eyethu setup a fish shop in 3 rd quarter of 2005. This is not enterprise development.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00071 - LUZIZI FISHING (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Compass Trawling JV			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
50% B 0%F	Occupational Categories (S6.5) Q.6.5 – 8 professionals 6.6.2 – 7 professionals	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) 0% B 0% F	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
No employee earns more than R16 000			
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R8 224,88		

General Comments:

<u>Employee info:</u> No Annex 8A / 6C to substantiate employee info.	<u>Reliance:</u> Appl. Pays processing fees (5.80% of turnover) & marketing fees (5.20% of turnover)	<u>Annex 1A (Relationship with other entities)</u> Applicant does not state on which info it relies	
--	---	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
S.8 (IRP5)	9	0	No explanation for jobs				
8.1.3	9	0	No explanation where jobs are desired from.				
8.1.1	Wage Bill / Ton	0	No explanation where the salary bill is derived from.				
11.2	Y	0	Empowerment deals not enterprise development.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: CD	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00072 - DMA FISHING ENTERPRISES (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant holds 39% in Snoek Wholesales and (through Aquatic Fish Producers, 38% in Noordkaap Visserman Onderneming BPK).			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	Table not completed and S8.1.1 (job creation) is not completed	No explanation of where employees come from.	No explanation of where employees come from.
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
Table not completed		No employee share scheme	
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		None claimed in 8.1.1 but 52 employees claimed in 8.1.3 [No explanation of where employees come from].	
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
None claimed by applicant in form	Turnover per ton: R2 500		

General Comments:			
6.4.2 – Employee benefits (pension) letter dated 29/07/2005 from Sanlam acknowledging applicant’s application form to belong to Provident Fund. Sanlam will revert (no approval yet)	Shareholding: No annexure 6G; therefore no explanation of % of shareholding.		

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
11.2	Y	N	Investment in Fishing Companies not enterprise.				
8.1.3 Total	52	0	No explanation where employees come development.				
8.1.3 Total less seasonal	52	0	No explanation where employees com from.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00075 - Community Workers Fishing Enterprises (Pty) Ltd	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant holds shares (21%) on the MFV Marie Claire vessel owning Co. Other shareholders are: Hoxies, Fernpar, Algoa Bay Sea Products and African Marine. Applicant will rely on MFV Marie Claire information.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5) Applicant (MFV Marie Claire) under caught in 2002 because of mechanical breakdown of the vessel's main engine; loss of 2 lives.	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) Merged with Marie Claire. 100% females 50% black
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) Not properly merged as applicant does not provide salary figures for its 2/3 employees. Does not correspond with salary band. Merged with Marie Claire. Recommend amendment = 0%	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) 50% female 100% black	Professionals (S6.6.2) Merged with MFV Marie Claire. No females 0% black
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) Does not correspond with table of top salary earners. Merged with Marie Claire. Recommend amendment = 0%	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8) Applicant claims to be 100% but shareholding of Juristic entities is not explained – Flow through principle not followed. Recommend amendment = 55% black	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8) none	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15) Auditors disagree with the total donated – see auditors report.	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) Applicant appears to have merged its own employees with all the employees in the MFV Marie without apportioning per shareholding. Other applicants using the same vessel provide that vessel has 56 employees	14. Safety (S7) Registration with Commissioner not audited although instructed to do so by Q & R after such an instruction was left out in Agreed Upon Procedures.
15. Investment (S9) Merged and apportioned correctly. Apportioned by using ownership of 21% Total insured: R3 150 000 Insured per ton: R5 206.99	16. Financial Performance (S11) Turnover per ton: R7 813. Auditors disagree why applicant in section 12.6. See auditors report.	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicant pays a marketing, processing and catching fee to the MFV Marie Claire vessel owning Co. JV			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
8.1.1	IRP5 -66	9 (0.0148)	See notes with respect to above				
8.1.3	32.85(Total& Permanent)	18 (total & permanent 0.03 per ton)	See notes above – what does this mean for per ton allocated????				
14.4	Y	N	Annexure 14D not provided by applicant for ESP and research				
11.1	Y	N	Annexure 11A not provided by applicant for value adding.				
6.2.2	Y	N	Applicant is a designated employer, period				
5.1	Y	N	Explanation acceptable.				
11.2	Y	N	Misunderstood enterprise development, as development of own enterprise.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: MR	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00076 - BP MARINE FISH PRODUCTS CC	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant was part of the dissolved Trachurus operational Joint Venture. Applicant has reserved its right to submit more information.			Applicant information only. 66% female 50% black
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
Applicant only. Members also employees 33% female 0% black	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	With respect to transformation annexures 6A – 65 are not provided by the applicant.		
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
No employees earning between level 5-10. In the levels 2,3, and 4 there are no black employees.	Unable to determine how the percentage interest held by black person is calculated. Recommend that it be amended to 0%		Auditors not conclusive on the pay roll amounts and training amounts.
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
Auditors provide that the donations made did not agree to the appropriate tax return.		Applicant has no sea based employees. IRP5 – 7 Total employees = 40 Permanent = 40 Apportioned with Horse Mackerel	Registration with Commissioner not audited although instructed to do so by Q & R after such an instruction was left out in Agreed Upon Procedures.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
Total insured: R5 104,160.00 Insured per ton: R23 789.00 Apportioned with Horse Mackerel.	Turnover per ton: R8 548.84		
General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicant pays a catching fee to Sea Harvest.	Other Fishing Right: Horse Mackerel	Access to a vessel: Applicant has a Catching Agreement with Sea Harvest and it is renewable annually.	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.8.1	30%	0	Applicant does not show how membership interest of black persons calculated.				
8.1.3	0.19	0.18	Calculation error.				
6.2.2	y	N	Applicant is a designated employer thus have to comply				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: MR	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00079 - VUNA FISHING COMPANY (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Applicant has a 50% shareholding in Seavuna through Spurious Investments (Pty) Ltd. Most of the directors same as Phambili.			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
			Registration with Commissioner not audited although instructed so by Q & R after the instruction was left out on Agreed Upon Procedures for auditors.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R11 595.31	Applicant is a member of the South African Deep Sea Trawling Industry and has contributed fees to the research undertaken by the association.	No detail vessel information.

General Comments:

EEA: Applicant is a designated employer but it did not comply with the act.			
--	--	--	--

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00095 - EFH WALTERS TRAWLING PTY LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Annexure 1A indicates that applicant operates alone.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5) Excludes director included in 6.5	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) Includes director – EFH Walters	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8) Black shareholders don't manage and have not been paid dividends.	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) Applicant did not complete table in 8.1.1	14. Safety (S7) Applicant did not answer 7.14 (Garbage Management Plan), but located one in annexure.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:
EEA COMPLIANCE:
Turnover according to 12A is approximately 5 million and applicant claims it is not a designated employer.

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
7.14	-	Y	Found Garbage Management Plan in Annexures.				
5.1	-	N	No evidence of under or over catch.				
6.1	N	Y	Applicant's turnover for higher than 2 million.				
14.4	Y	N	Applicant says it pays levies to the department, no levies ever paid according to 15.1.				
6.18	Y	N	Auditors don't agree.				
6.4.1	6 (total)	0	Seems to include director, information unreliable.				
11.1	Y	N	Insufficient information regarding value adding initiatives.				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: CL	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00048 – SACO FISHING (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant is 70% owned by Pioneer Fishing. Applicant is a shareholder of Eyethu Fishing [27,7%]. Applicant in a JV with Ziyabuya Fishing, Pioneer East Coast, G&T Fishing and Siyapambili Fishing.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) See comment below.
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) Correctly merged 77,7% Black 0% Female	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) 66.8% Black 0% Female	Professionals (S6.6.2) 100% Black 2% Female
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) 52.9% Black 5.8% Female	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8) 62.2% Black 14.88% Female	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10) - pays levies - skills development programmes through SETA
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15) - No tax deductible donations - Other donations	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21) Policy of Eyethu Fishing	13. Jobs (S8) Apportioned between all JV partners. IRP5 = 58 Per ton = 0.06 (0.057)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9) Insured value = R11 146 382m Per ton = R7923,66	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12) Applicant sponsors research through their shareholding in Eyethu Fishing.	17. Fishing Plan (S13) Fishing plan most important aspects.
General Comments: Applicant holds shares in a New Entrant – does not disclose who the new entrant is.	Value Adding: - Hake packing & freezing - Hake Filleting - Haddock Processing - Hake Canning	Investment in Processing: - Applicant is shareholder in Eyethu Fishing. Eyethu invested almost R28 million in land based processing infrastructure.	

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
6.3.1	15 listed = 80% Black / 0% female	19 listed = 78.9% Black / 0% Female	Applicant did not merge info correctly with JV partners				
11.2	Y	N	Info does not amount to Enterprise Development				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1:	
Application Name and Number: HDSM00005 - GELAARS BOTE EDMS BPK	AdCom 2: HK	Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Many sister companies not involved in fishing. Owns factory, Pelagic quota.	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)

General Comments:			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: Cheslyn	Date:
Application Name and Number: HDSM00021 – Dyer Eiland Visserye	AdCom 2: HK	

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)
Holds 66.67% share in L & A Fishing (Pty)		2002 under caught by 34.72% - vessel had problems with winches and engines. This caused loss of fishing days.	2/7 = 28.5%
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
0%	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)	Professionals (S6.6.2)
	10% employees listed	No Managers in 6.5 but in 6.6.1 five Managers listed	0%
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
0/1 = 0%	28.57%		
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8)	14. Safety (S7)
		IRP5 – 20 = 0.04 per ton Total – 23 Permanent – 23	Section 7.9 not audited since applicants were not asked to do so in the Agreed Upon Procedures for auditors but we advised them to do so in the Queries and Responses.
15. Investment (S9)	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)	17. Fishing Plan (S13)
	Turnover per ton: R10 836		

General Comments:			
Reliance: Applicant said "no"	Auditors Report Discrepancies: 6.1 – Information in schedule and requirements of EEA was not correctly performed. 6.2.1 EE plan has not been approved. 6.10 Were not able to sight receipt of workplace skills plan or Annual Training Report.	Access to suitable vessel: More than 50% owner.	Investment in processing of R6million in Gansbaai, tarred a road and installed electricity

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
5.1	Y	N	Reason for under catch explained, only one year				
11.1	Y	N	No proper explanation of value adding				

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH) | AdCom 1: MR
 Application Name and Number: HDSM00049 – PORT NOLLOTH FISHERIES (PTY) LTD | AdCom 2: HKCD | Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A)		2. Compliance (S3)		3. Catch Utilisation (S5)		4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The vessel employs 20 experienced 20 HDP - Emile Adrien vessel co.(Pty) Ltd – JV – applicant part of this JV between 2001- 2003 - Relies on information of both the Emile Adrien JV Algoa Fishing JV - Initially known as Pampino Nineteen (Pty) Ltd - Tuscan Mood 289 (Pty) Ltd JV – WCRL applicant has a 32% equity ownership – vessel valued at R253 360.00 - Algoa Fishing (Pty) Ltd – JV with Hermanus Sea Foods on the Cobelo. Vessel valued at R3 080 000.00 				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - applicant under caught by 78% in 2002 because of late announcement of appeal decisions. 			
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2)		6. Transformation Employment Equity					
Merged with Algoa Fishing 100% Black% 33.33% Female		Occupational Categories (S6.5)		Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1)		Professionals (S6.6.2)	
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4)		8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8)		9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8)		10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Merged with Algoa Fishing (Pty) Ltd - The information does not correspond with information provided in 6.3.2 for salary earners. 100% Black 0% Female 		50.1% Black 27.83% Female					
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)		12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)		13. Jobs (S8)		14. Safety (S7)	
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - merged information of the two JV partners Emile Adrien JV Algoa Fishing JV's with applicant. 			
15. Investment (S9)		16. Financial Performance (S11)		17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12)		17. Fishing Plan (S13)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - merged information of the two JV partners, Algoa Fishing and Emile Adrien information - for 2002 and 2003 uses Emile Adrien information - for 2004 uses Algoa Fishing - the information is not apportioned 				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - applicant intends to undertake ESP 			
General Comments:		Enterprise Development:		Investment on Processing Activities:		Value Adding:	
		Gave 50% an employee trust Also supporting the establishment of a handcraft factory by providing finance and availing funds		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Invested in a JV with Hermanus Sea Foods and has access to shore based processing facility (HACCP) - The vessel has on-board processing facility. 			

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date

ASSESSMENT SHEET

Sector: Hake Deep Sea Trawl (MTRH)	AdCom 1: CD
Application Name and Number: HDSM00067 – LAINGVILLE FISHERIES (PTY) LTD	AdCom 2: HK Date:

COMMENTS

1. Relationship with other Entities (Annexure 1A) Applicant purchased 50% share in nominated vessel Applicant owns a fish processing plant @ Sandy Point Harbour, St Helena Bay. Will also apply for rights in pilchard, WCRL, HLL Applicant relies on info of L-V Fishing (Pty) Ltd	2. Compliance (S3)	3. Catch Utilisation (S5)	4. Transformation – Board of Directors (S6.3.1) 50% Black 0% Female
5. Transformation – Top Salary Earners (S6.3.2) 0% Black 0% Female	6. Transformation Employment Equity		
	Occupational Categories (S6.5)	Top and Senior Managers (S6.6.1) 100% Black 0% F	Professionals (S6.6.2) 100% Black 50% Female
7. Transformation – Income Levels (S6.4) See comment below.	8. Transformation - Ownership (Race & Gender) (S6.7 & 6.8) 100% Black 0% Female	9. Transformation - Ownership – Employee Share Schemes (S6.7 & 6.8) No employee share scheme	10. Transformation - Skills Development (S6.10)
11. Transformation - Corporate Social Investment (S6.15)	12. Transformation – Affirmative Procurement (S6.21)	13. Jobs (S8) Total jobs = 107 IRP5 = 18 jobs Per ton = see comment below	14. Safety (S7)
15. Investment (S9) Insured = 0 Per ton = 0	16. Financial Performance (S11)	17. Environmentally Sustainable Practices (S12) Directors are involved in the MSC process Extensive research has been conducted in the following areas: vessel engineering, refrigeration on production system	17. Fishing Plan (S13) Covers all areas
General Comments:			
	<u>Value Adding</u> No annexure	<u>Enterprise Development</u> No annexure	<u>Processing</u> Applicant is in JV with LV Fishing to (processing plant)

Data Amendments

Section	Applicant Response	Assessment Response	Comments	DA Agree	DA Disagree	DA Signature	Date
11.1	Y	N	Applicant says 'yes' to value adding but 'no' annexure 11A				
11.2	Y	N	Applicant says 'yes' to enterprise development but 'no' to annexure 11B				
6.4.1	100% Black; 0% Female		Applicant claims 3 top salary earners (all of whom are white) in 6.3.2 but claims a black salary earner in 6.4.1 (earning R20 000 – R25 000).				